STATEMENT OF HERITAGE IMPACT

Lyndoch Place: 2 Barker Road, Strathfield (corner Chalmers Road)
Proposed amendments to approval of DA 2007/299

PROPOSAL: This Statement of Heritage Impact forms part of the Statement of Environmental Effects modified for s.96 at Lyndoch Place 2 Barker Rd, Strathfield. The owners now seek minor amendments to the existing development consent dated 2010 + (CC in 2013) comprising deletion of some approved alterations and other new minor alterations on the ground, to the summer house, pool location, and new landscaping.

DATE: Dec 2016

REFERENCE: Strathfield Municipal Council – DCP Part A Dwelling and Ancillary Structures. Schedule 2 of LEP 105; Inventory No.237 (landscape)

ADDRESS: 2 BARKER ROAD, STRATHFIELD 2135
Lot 2; DP 325296; Folio 2/325296; Parish: Concord; County: Cumberland

AUTHOR: Patrick O’Carrigan FRAIA, AIAMA NSW Registered Architect # 5025, Studio 1st Floor 76 Edwin Street North, Croydon NSW 2132
Tel 9799 6600, Fax 9799 6011 Email patrick@pocp.com.au

Patrick O’Carrigan FRAIA is a recognised heritage architect listed by the Heritage Office of NSW. He has over 28 years experience in the field, having previously worked with Clive Lucas and Howard Tanner. He is the author of many Heritage Impact Statements, conservation plans and award winning heritage refurbishment projects including Customs House [City of Sydney], Story of Sydney, Pilgrim House, and Pitt Street Uniting Church. He was a Heritage Adviser of four years standing, for two rural shires, Merriwa and Murrurundi. He was appointed the Heritage Professional Member of the Heritage Review Panel for Woollahra Council 2006. He undertook the Stage IV heritage Inventory for Hornsby Shire Council.

METHODOLOGY:
The report has been generally prepared in accordance with the requirements of Australia ICOMOS Burra Charter, the NSW Heritage Manuals “Statements of Heritage Impact” as issued by NSW Heritage Office 1996.

PREPARED: Richard + Rachelle Nader
6 Myee Ave Strathfield

LIMITATIONS: The report has been prepared by Patrick O’Carrigan FRAIA, Andrew Wu of Patrick O’Carrigan + Partners Pty. Ltd., and is based upon site inspections on more than two occasions and client instructions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Initial</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>For client review</td>
<td>05/05/09</td>
<td>POC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Final</td>
<td>For submission</td>
<td>15/05/09</td>
<td>POC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>For amended DA</td>
<td>11/01/16</td>
<td>POC</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

1.1 GENERAL

The 1880 Advertisement describes the Bushy Hill Estate as rightly timbered with turpentine trees “and not affected by the strong sea breeze injurious to many”. Lyndoch Place is a regular shaped rectilinear block of 1214 sqm with a frontage of 26.83 to Barker Road on the southern side at the termination of Barker Rd and Chalmers Rd Strathfield. A two storey house was built in the mid 1930’s at 2 Barker Road and called ‘Lyndoch Place’. The land was allocated into two allotments but not subsequently subdivided.

At the time of construction, a formal entry directly off the corner of the block was built with brick piers and timber gates. In the late 1960’s to early 70’s a pool, double carport, and partially elevated concourse were added on the west side of the house.

1.2 SITE HISTORY

In 1823, the Chaplain of St James’s Church, was granted a 180 hectare ‘glebe’ (from the Latin glaeba meaning ‘clod of earth’ and refers to a piece of land given to a church) which was transferred back to the Crown in 1827 and reallocated in 1841. Joseph Newton purchased the southern 283 acres of the abolished glebe and Joseph Hyde Potts, First Secretary of the Bank of NSW, purchased the northern 256 acres. Barker Rd is the boundary between the Newton [later Josephson] and Potts Estates.

Lyndoch Place is located near the highest part of Strathfield and the site enjoys district views falling away to east and west.
To the east, the nearby “Bushy Hill Estate”, was subdivided in 1880 and included the area now known as Albyn Road. Bushy Hill was said to describe the natural environment of the area with its distinctive stands of mature trees.

Nearby Newton Road is located on Joseph Newton’s original 1841 grant, later acquired by Judge Josephson in 1858 and subdivided for residential development in 1916 as the “Josephson Estate”.

To the south (now subdivided and redeveloped) on the west side of Chalmers Road is the famous Victorian Mansion “The White House” built for Leonard Keep, a prominent hardware retailer (John Keep & Co) and originally called “Wynola”. It is probable that the subject site was subdivided from the White House/Wynola Estate with a frontage of 100ft on Barker Road and 120ft on Chalmers with a 17ft 5inch splay at the intersection. It is probable that the two mature Auracaria bidwilli [Bunya Pines] predate Lyndoch Manor and were part of the original entry to Wynola/White House off the terminus of Redmyre Road.

Lyndoch Place was one of many two storey houses on Barker Road designed and built by architect John Brogan. The property is considered as an example of “Inter War Old English Style” and is a heritage item in Schedule 2 of the LEP. However, it is not located within a heritage conservation area.

The original subdivision included a “brick and stone” covenant on title and the land was equal to 1 rood and 18 perches in area (1214sqm).

The house was commissioned by Charles Donald Saxton after he acquired the property by Certificate of Transfer on 19 February 1930. The title deed recorded that after 12 years, the ownership transferred to Norman Verne Bush, Butcher of Five Dock on 2 March 1942.

The house was acquired by Terry Robert Malpass and Donna Lee Malpass, Company Director and Teacher respectively in 2000. The previous owners, Mark Graham Johnson, acquired the house at auction on 30 June 2007 with settlement on September 2007. It has remained vacant since then.

Figure 2: Advertisement for land in the Bushy Hill Estate (Jones C., 2003, Strathfield Heritage Tour 2003)
A previous consent designed by Patrick O'Carrigan and Partners was approved in 2009. A s.96 application was lodged and approved in 2010. Subsequently, design control passed to Clive Lucas Stapleton and Partners. They made alterations to the detail and features and, after No 6 Barker was purchased by APG Constructions, the pool house and pool were relocated to the adjacent site. This scheme was approved by council and given CC approval by A Protas in 2013. In 2014, there was an application to demolish the listed building.

1.3 ADJACENT HERITAGE ITEMS

This subject site is immediately adjacent to two local heritage items though the proposal has no impact upon those items due to distance and the fact that the proposed works are in keeping with the architectural style of Lyndoch Manor. The adjacent items are:

- Inter-war California Bungalow in No. 4 Chalmers Road, built in 1926. Which represents good example of an Inter-war California Bungalow with low pitched gabled roofs with shingles, face brickwork and deep verandahs

- Warrington – Inter-War Bungalow style house in No. 26 Elwin Street, built in 1922. With evident elements of the style like: prominent terracotta tiled roof with a broken back extension over the front verandah, broad gables facing the street and face brick wall contrasting with roughcast render. Located on the corner site immediately opposite No. 2 Barker Road, this house has complementary street fence, which was redone in 2009 in brick to a raised height.

1.4 ARCHITECTURAL STYLE

The style of architecture associated with John R. Brogan is called “Inter-War Old English”. This style exploits the visually prominent attributes of traditional English rural architecture and is considered a reinterpretation of Tudor Street architecture. It is also colloquially known as “Stockbroker’s Tudor” in North America [understandably after the Boston Tea Party made all things English unmentionable].

The exterior characteristics of the Inter-War Old English residences according to Apperley et al include:

- Picturesque asymmetry.
- Imitation half-timbering extensively used in gables and upper storey, often with herringbone or chequered brick nogging.
- Medium-pitched gabled roofs usually tiles with timber bargeboards.
- Elaborate tall brick chimneys’ often with terracotta pots.
- Principal wall material: face brickwork, often textured.
- Usually casement sashes with leadlight glazing, often with a diamond pattern
- Gate houses and arched gate entries or porches.
Figure 3: Typical Characteristics of Inter-War Old English Residences (Stapleton et al., 1997 Australian House Styles Illustrated Guide 1788 to present)

Description of 2 Barker Rd, Strathfield

Richardson & Wrench Real estate describes Lyndoch Place in 2007 as:

"Including 5 bedrooms with separate parent’s and kids/teenage retreat areas adjoining the bedrooms, impressive entrance foyer, gracious formal lounge, a spacious formal dining room, sunny north facing breakfast room, entertainers kitchen with eat-in area, living room/media room, a fully detached summer house overlooking the IG pool and pergola area, 4 Bedrooms (one stunning in period style), ducted reverse air-conditioning alarm and covered parking for three cars and secured off street parking."
Current Description:

The house has stood almost wholly demolished and open to the elements since 2011. Clearly an attempt at demolition by neglect, the only partial works completed in the time include:

1. Erection of footings and slab of garage and laundry
2. Slab and new brickwork to summer house
3. Ground works – extensive excavation
4. Removal of remaining garden
5. Loss of two landmark araucarias
1.5 SIGNIFICANCE

1.5 Historical Significance

The Lyndoch Place is one of Strathfield’s most stately residences and a fabulous family home for entertaining. Built in 1935 for the Saxon family, exclusive timber merchants of the day, the house was designed by renowned Architect, John Brogan. The former clients have conducted further research since the original DA was submitted on the works of Brogan including accessing the files of the Mitchell Library. These archives hold his major architectural drawings – alas there is no set for this address. Other works attributable to John R. Brogan in Strathfield include:

- 23 Newton Road, English Tudor Style built for Tobacco Merchant, Royston Stuckey Cozens;
- “Crosby”, 12 Wallis Ave, Built 1934 for Mr. Thackway, a Company Director.
In comparison with other Brogan residences of the period, Lyndoch Place is much less picturesque, is less refined in composition and is without asymmetrical massing.

**Aesthetic Significance**

Barker Road has a mix of double and single storey dwellings, some behind blank garage and wall and some behind garden setbacks. Lyndoch Place sits on a high and commanding north-east corner position across approximately 1200m² of secure landscaped grounds with established trees, structured gardens and sweeping pathways. Lyndoch Place is a prominent example, through not of the first order, of the English Neo-Tudor style which was popular in Strathfield particularly in the 1930's.

**Landscape Significance**

The heritage listing by Fox & Associates [1988] records only the two prominent Auracaria bidwilli [Bunya Pines] as elements of the item which gave 2 Barker Road its entry in the schedule of heritage items.
Social Significance

Lyndoch Place has a limited association or relevance to early 20\textsuperscript{th} century individuals, namely A.J. Bush & Sons, Butchers locally associated with the meat and livestock and the Architect, John Brogan. The houses of John R. Brogan are generally individually designed and are a complex form, dominated by extensive gables and prominent rooflines and each house is aligned to address its frontage and entry sequences.

Rarity, Integrity and Representativeness
Lyndoch Place is not rare as a mid 1930s ‘infill building’. It is a typical example of the standard, largely rectangular houses built during the 1930’s. The integrity of Lyndoch Place is moderately high due to its almost intact state. Its integrity however is reduced due to the additions of intrusive and unsympathetic forms, materials and finishes.

**Technical Significance**

Lyndoch Place exhibits no particular technical expertise other than sound master building in its construction and an aesthetic that is common elsewhere in similar period houses in Strathfield.

![Figure 8: Terra cotta shingles to side wall of rear gable-only instance in house (left) Current (right)](image)

2. **DESCRIPTION OF SCOPE OF WORK**

2.1 **PREVIOUS MODIFICATIONS**

Lyndoch Place whilst formerly intact – is now a ruin. The most significant fabric are gone. In the formal room and in the retention the original stained joinery has been modified throughout the 20th century in response to changing occupant’s needs and social fashions including:

- The increased importance of private car parking- it is likely that the summer house was originally a garage;
The post war prosperity and the boost of the Melbourne Olympic games gave to erecting private swimming pools;

Internal alterations in response to changing family needs and interior decorating fashions;

- Infill of first floor balcony [hence sloping floor deck] with sliding glazing—probably post war
- Removal of partition in upper children’s play area—possibly inter-war sleepout
- Insertion of caneite partition walls to create small fifth bedroom in SW corner at first floor c. 1950’s
- New carport c. 1960’s attached to south eastern portion of house.
- New kitchen c. 1980’s meant eastern end of ground floor is extensively modified;
- Replacement of two windows at first floor with glass blocks
- Removal of copper and disuse of its chimney
- New Bed 4 bathroom c. 2002 with pebble borders dates from the previous owners, the Malpass [see Figure below]
- Late 20th century modifications to master bathroom including tapware, lamps and vanities
- Removal of splayed wall gas heater in dining room
- Lowered ceiling and non-matching plasterwork and cornice in dining room associated with removal of wall and insertion of bathroom above
- New aluminium open framed double carport between pool and summer house
- Insertion of c. 1960’s parquetry flooring in dining room on ground floor and parent’s retreat on first floor
- New powder-coated aluminium sliding doors on south and west ground floor facades
- New projection screen and cabling and metal inserts in main brick fireplace in lounge room
- New split cycle airconditioning to kitchen area by the Malpass’
- Pool concourse has been re laid at least twice as two levels of screed and terra cotta paving are evident at the access hatch on north end of the pool;
- Through the erection of a red textured brick c.1960s retaining wall [bricks are different to original house] across the northern front of the house and returning down the west side to enclose the partially in-ground pool;
- Upgrading the interior of the summer house by the Malpass’ since 2000; (demolished)
- Painting of trim and front fence in French Blue by the Malpass’ dates since 2001; (demolished)
DESIGN APPROACH

In approaching the refurbishment design of 2 Barker Rd, the architects have been mindful of the need not to reproduce a slavish copy of a specific Barker Rd heritage residence. This would neither be authentic nor appropriate to the philosophy of the Burra Charter. The major scope of work is limited in scale and detail to the less original and hence significant portions of the house, namely the rear and side elements on the south and west.

Since achieving consent in 2008, the clients have engaged a builder, APG Constructions Pty. Ltd who has made site investigations and has advised them on structural defects and issues to do with the of certain building components.

Council previously granted development Consent 2007/299 to allow alterations and additions to the premises. This s.96 application should be read in conjunction with the new DA Application being lodged simultaneously and includes:

1. **Ground floor deletions and alterations**
   
   **Deletions:**
   
   - Infill two windows right and left of fireplace in formal sitting room approved in DA 2007/299, so the west wall of formal sitting room stays intact.
   - Reduce width of verandah off garage
Retain rear/south entry door to stair hall in lieu of infill
Delete proposed north wall door in laundry – leave wall intact

Alterations:
Erect new hood on timber brackets over existing doors off breakfast room to north garden and resurrect the former steps
Relocate proposed kitchen to south wall of family room
Demolish linen and double sided joinery between hall and family room, retaining panelled doors for re-use upstairs
Convert approved bi-fold doors on west façade of garage into 2x French doors (one pair adjacent pool is fixed, locked at 1500)
Erect new AC unit louvered enclosures on right and left side of garage entry
Convert approved bi-fold doors on west wall of new kitchen into sliding doors
Change approved window to a new pair French doors [fixed] to informal dining/conservatory at NE corner of house
Replace bricked floor to breakfast room with traditional T&G flooring to match remainder of house
Widen west wall colonnade to match rear verandah after demolition of existing pool
Convert approved 2 windows in existing kitchen (east façade) into pair of windows either side of fireplace;
Insert traditional panelled door into existing door jamb at entry to guest wc off main lobby[ see photographs below]

Figure 12: Existing Door jamb showing checkout for former door to be reinstated; and right- timber brackets to be used as model for hood over front bay doors.

2. First floor alterations
Relocate bathroom in gym/studio on west wall, insert first floor washer dryer
Make passage between bedroom 5 and outer west wall with linen closet
Demolish late 20th century bathroom off bedroom 4
Erect new bathroom and w/in robe instead of bedroom 5
Enlarge family bathroom (next to the stairs) towards west wall
Convert former master ensuite to master dressing room
Convert former parents retreat to master bathroom
Demolish clothes chute in linen
Add 2 low profile Velux skylights in master wc/bidet and storage
Shift location of approved door for master bathroom from master bedroom
Make open timber pergola above verandah on ground floor on south façade
Erect new gable on south side (next to existing gable). Deleted eyelid dormer over stairs as per condition in red on DA 2007/299
3. **Alterations to the summer house:**

*Deletions:*
- Delete proposed fireplace on approved location on north wall of summer house
- Delete verandah/pergola to summer house
- Delete kitchenette in the summer house

*Alterations:*
- Reorganize bathroom and shower room along west wall of summer house creating new external door for pool change use
- Form new slab in summer house due to poor state of existing slab

4. **External alterations:**

*Deletions:*
- Deletion of proposed ramp from garage into garden
- Demolition of existing c.1960’s terrace on north side
- Relocation of existing water tank in west garden – insert partly under verandah
- Demolition of existing pool and retaining wall - infill using void for buried water tank, backfill with sound excavated new pool soil

*Alterations:*
- Erection of new fence + gate between drying court and pool concourse
- Erection of new steps on west side of garden, in line with house
- Erection of new retaining wall on boundary with No.4 Barker Road due to removal of former pool and restoration of lawn and planters
- Increase RL in south garden from 33.92 to 34.10 with same level of 34.10 up to north west corner of the house (verandah)
- Reduce length of planters flanking front entry steps, erect matching new planters elsewhere to front
- Erection of new traditional steps on north wall of approved new conservatory to garden
- Demolition of existing paling fence, continue the brick fence piers on the east boundary to make the fence uniform – height + detail
- Insert new security grille door on north arch of Chalmers Road porch- not visible from street.

*Figure 13: West Elevation: Former pool from NW corner that was demolished and lawn and garden beds now to be reinstated.*
- Relocate approved new pool pump/heater equipment from west boundary to rear of garage.

Refer to separate DA for a list of modifications including the Lychgate, new pool, paving fencing and ancillary items, and new BBQ.

3. ASSESSMENT OF IMPACT

3.1 IMPACT ON HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE

The existing building has been identified as being a heritage item and is listed in Schedule 2 of the Heritage LEP. Due to its prominent position on the corner of Barker Road and Chalmers Road, Lyndoch Place requires special consideration to make it sympathetic with Strathfield’s traditional streetscape. The proposed alterations and deletions encompassed in this s.96 application are largely internal, minor in scope and without impact on the most significant portions of the house.

The already approved alterations and additions are located at the rear. And they envisaged contemporary insertions in the interior of the items. These s.96 modifications will have minor or nil environmental impacts as attested in the Statement of Environmental Effects. These further modifications, together with suggested materials and finishes will improve the existing amenity and usability of the home. The increased interior space will enhance the lifestyle of the owners.

The new sympathetic interior form and finishes within a traditional envelope may well influence the immediate neighbours to adopt a similar approach. The Municipality would benefit form more examples of sympathetically extended period dwellings especially those in the mock Tudor style which to date have either been demolished or rendered over [eg House in Glenarvon Street]

3.2 MEASURES TO MINIMISE IMPACT

The following measures are recommended:

- Retention of all stained timber joinery [ architraves, trim, skirting, stair treads etc]
- Retention of all disused original panelled doors and joinery for re-incorporation in areas of extensions.
- Paint colour, textures interiors should be of colours sympathetic to the period.
- Use of cavities, voids and shafts is encouraged to minimise areas of chasing for new services
- External Timber, where appropriate, will be dressed and silhouette cut to match the house brackets etc
- Care should be taken in the selection of material, colours finishes, details and workmanship.
- Use of tradespersons with appropriate skills in traditional building techniques will help preserve building fabric
4. ATTACHMENTS

- The drawing set by Patrick O'Carrigan + Partners. Ltd.

5. REFERENCES

- Strathfield Council Draft Heritage Inventory Listing, December 2005, *Draft Local Environmental Plan No. 105 (Heritage)*.
- Mitchell Library Architectural Drawings Collection of J. Brogan
- Richardson & Wrench, 2 Barker Road Strathfield, Real Estate Brochure.